

Supplementary Tables for *Getting Handcuffs on an Octopus:  
Minimum Wages, Employment, and Turnover*

R. Kaj Gittings  
kaj.gittings@ttu.edu

Ian M. Schmutte  
schmutte@uga.edu

January 2015

**Abstract**

This appendix includes supporting tables and details of data construction for Gittings and Schmutte (2015).

Table 1: Heterogeneity in Estimated Employment Elasticity by Turnover: State-Industry Deciles

	(1)	(2)	(3)	(4)
Turnover				
Decile				
1	−0.508 (.2079)	−0.504 (.2306)	−0.525 (.2201)	−0.575 (.2587)
2	−0.650 (.2423)	−0.646 (.2333)	−0.641 (.2396)	−0.717 (.2316)
3	−0.359 (.1860)	−0.355 (.2055)	−0.346 (.1762)	−0.426 (.2327)
4	−0.207 (.1469)	−0.203 (.1167)	−0.193 (.1451)	−0.274 (.1561)
5	0.098 (.1087)	0.102 (.0898)	0.092 (.1120)	0.031 (.0905)
6	0.138 (.1238)	0.142 (.1104)	0.138 (.1252)	0.071 (.0815)
7	0.337 (.1050)	0.340 (.0908)	0.319 (.1121)	0.270 (.0754)
8	0.438 (.0703)	0.442 (.0591)	0.431 (.0703)	0.371 (.0712)
9	0.388 (.1026)	0.392 (.0843)	0.366 (.1027)	0.322 (.0833)
10	0.409 (.0561)	0.412 (.0752)	0.381 (.0546)	0.336 (.0783)
State-Quarter	<i>Y</i>	<i>Y</i>	<i>Y</i>	<i>N</i>
State-Recession	<i>Y</i>	<i>Y</i>	<i>Y</i>	<i>N</i>
Region-Period	<i>Y</i>	<i>Y</i>	<i>Y</i>	<i>N</i>
Saturated	<i>N</i>	<i>Y</i>	<i>N</i>	<i>N</i>
Exclude Distorted	<i>N</i>	<i>N</i>	<i>Y</i>	<i>N</i>
Num. Obs.	244, 332	244, 332	224, 244	244, 332

Table entries are elasticities of employment with respect to the minimum wage evaluated at each decile of the turnover (worker reallocation rate) distribution. The unit of observation is a state-NAICS3-quarter combination. In this table, each observation is assigned into a decile of the within-state distribution of turnover across 3-digit NAICS industries. Parenthesized values are robust standard errors clustered at the state level. Column (1) reports a benchmark specification. Column (2) presents the fully saturated specification with state-specific unemployment, state-recession, and state-unemployment-recession effects. Column (3) presents the benchmark, but excludes observations that were substantially distorted as part of QWI confidentiality protection (flag=9). Column (4) presents a standard panel model with state controls, period controls, and state-specific trends.

Table 2: Heterogeneity in Estimated Employment Elasticity by Turnover: State-Industry Deciles; with State-Sector Trends

	(1)	(2)	(3)	(4)
Turnover				
Decile				
1	-0.646 (.2306)	-0.642 (.2566)	-0.687 (.2450)	-0.709 (.2824)
2	-0.400 (.1847)	-0.395 (.1679)	-0.417 (.1833)	-0.462 (.1758)
3	-0.143 (.1204)	-0.138 (.1371)	-0.148 (.1180)	-0.206 (.1527)
4	-0.149 (.1778)	-0.144 (.1387)	-0.154 (.1758)	-0.211 (.1784)
5	-0.006 (.1033)	-0.002 (.0925)	-0.008 (.1039)	-0.069 (.1012)
6	0.218 (.1301)	0.223 (.1264)	0.218 (.1356)	0.154 (.1004)
7	0.332 (.0881)	0.337 (.0855)	0.322 (.0938)	0.269 (.0760)
8	0.474 (.1126)	0.479 (.1001)	0.489 (.1193)	0.410 (.1021)
9	0.351 (.1029)	0.356 (.0924)	0.357 (.1086)	0.289 (.0850)
10	0.122 (.0704)	0.126 (.0944)	0.102 (.0714)	0.057 (.1138)
State-Quarter	Y	Y	Y	N
State-Recession	Y	Y	Y	N
Region-Period	Y	Y	Y	N
Saturated	N	Y	N	N
Exclude Distorted	N	N	Y	N
Num. Obs.	244, 332	244, 332	224, 244	244, 332

Table entries are elasticities of employment with respect to the minimum wage evaluated at each decile of the turnover (worker reallocation rate) distribution. The unit of observation is a state-NAICS3-quarter combination. In this table, each observation is assigned into a decile of the within-state distribution of turnover across 3-digit NAICS industries. Parenthesized values are robust standard errors clustered at the state level. All models include state-sector trends. Column (1) reports a benchmark specification. Column (2) presents the fully saturated specification with state-specific unemployment, state-recession, and state-unemployment-recession effects. Column (3) presents the benchmark, but excludes observations that were substantially distorted as part of QWI confidentiality protection (flag=9). Column (4) presents a standard panel model with state controls, period controls, and state-sector trends.

Table 3: Heterogeneity in Estimated Employment Elasticity by Average Duration of Non-employment for Separating Workers: State-Industry Deciles

	(1)	(2)	(3)	(4)
Avg. Duration				
Decile				
1	-0.467 (.1399)	-0.462 (.1631)	-0.514 (.1549)	-0.534 (.1987)
2	-0.856 (.3077)	-0.852 (.3082)	-0.873 (.3116)	-0.925 (.3169)
3	-0.823 (.2649)	-0.818 (.2791)	-0.824 (.2634)	-0.891 (.3146)
4	0.164 (.1250)	0.169 (.1205)	0.142 (.1234)	0.096 (.1415)
5	0.262 (.0969)	0.267 (.0780)	0.258 (.0998)	0.190 (.0741)
6	0.253 (.0950)	0.258 (.0773)	0.245 (.1006)	0.185 (.0761)
7	0.281 (.1118)	0.286 (.0939)	0.267 (.1150)	0.213 (.0910)
8	0.402 (.1026)	0.407 (.0865)	0.382 (.1103)	0.334 (.0690)
9	0.372 (.1427)	0.376 (.1320)	0.348 (.1494)	0.303 (.0998)
10	0.539 (.1347)	0.544 (.1250)	0.510 (.1450)	0.466 (.0989)
State-Quarter	<i>Y</i>	<i>Y</i>	<i>Y</i>	<i>N</i>
State-Recession	<i>Y</i>	<i>Y</i>	<i>Y</i>	<i>N</i>
Region-Period	<i>Y</i>	<i>Y</i>	<i>Y</i>	<i>N</i>
Saturated	<i>N</i>	<i>Y</i>	<i>N</i>	<i>N</i>
Exclude Distorted	<i>N</i>	<i>N</i>	<i>Y</i>	<i>N</i>
Num. Obs.	244, 332	244, 332	224, 244	244, 332

Table entries are elasticities of employment with respect to the minimum wage evaluated at each decile of the distribution of average periods of non-employment for separations. The unit of observation is a state-NAICS3-quarter combination. In this table, each observation is assigned into a decile of the within-state distribution of turnover across 3-digit NAICS industries. Parenthesized values are robust standard errors clustered at the state level. Column (1) reports a benchmark specification. Column (2) presents the fully saturated specification with state-specific unemployment, state-recession, and state-unemployment-recession effects. Column (3) presents the benchmark, but excludes observations that were substantially distorted as part of QWI confidentiality protection (flag=9). Column (4) presents a standard panel model with state controls, period controls, and state-specific trends.

Table 4: Heterogeneity in Estimated Employment Elasticity by Average Duration of Non-employment for Separating Workers: State-Industry Deciles; with State-Sector Trends

	(1)	(2)	(3)	(4)
Avg. Duration				
Decile				
1	-0.245 (.1058)	-0.239 (.1195)	-0.267 (.1158)	-0.308 (.1461)
2	-0.429 (.2666)	-0.425 (.2622)	-0.472 (.2666)	-0.493 (.2575)
3	-0.561 (.1896)	-0.556 (.2126)	-0.581 (.1938)	-0.625 (.2437)
4	0.235 (.1423)	0.241 (.1324)	0.224 (.1382)	0.171 (.1690)
5	0.239 (.0930)	0.245 (.0752)	0.235 (.0981)	0.175 (.0987)
6	0.209 (.0897)	0.215 (.0855)	0.205 (.0955)	0.145 (.0928)
7	0.099 (.0729)	0.105 (.0611)	0.090 (.0753)	0.036 (.0778)
8	0.141 (.1037)	0.147 (.0948)	0.124 (.1131)	0.076 (.0672)
9	0.207 (.0947)	0.213 (.0812)	0.199 (.1027)	0.144 (.0742)
10	0.235 (.0903)	0.240 (.0797)	0.227 (.0993)	0.171 (.0674)
State-Quarter	Y	Y	Y	N
State-Recession	Y	Y	Y	N
Region-Period	Y	Y	Y	N
Saturated	N	Y	N	N
Exclude Distorted	N	N	Y	N
Num. Obs.	244, 332	244, 332	224, 244	244, 332

Table entries are elasticities of employment with respect to the minimum wage evaluated at each decile of the distribution of average periods of non-employment for separations. The unit of observation is a state-NAICS3-quarter combination. In this table, each observation is assigned into a decile of the within-state distribution of turnover across 3-digit NAICS industries. Parenthesized values are robust standard errors clustered at the state level. All models include state-sector trends. Column (1) reports a benchmark specification. Column (2) presents the fully saturated specification with state-specific unemployment, state-recession, and state-unemployment-recession effects. Column (3) presents the benchmark, but excludes observations that were substantially distorted as part of QWI confidentiality protection (flag=9). Column (4) presents a standard panel model with state controls, period controls, and state-sector trends.

Table 5: Heterogeneity in Estimated Employment Elasticity by Turnover: National Industry Deciles

	(1)	(2)	(3)	(4)
Turnover				
Decile				
1	-0.703 (.1859)	-0.703 (.2119)	-0.658 (.1723)	-0.773 (.2349)
2	-0.200 (.0838)	-0.199 (.0700)	-0.196 (.0857)	-0.269 (.1102)
3	-1.345 (.2715)	-1.344 (.2744)	-1.316 (.2631)	-1.414 (.2988)
4	0.237 (.0913)	0.238 (.0708)	0.233 (.0969)	0.167 (.0686)
5	0.301 (.0971)	0.302 (.0859)	0.289 (.1017)	0.232 (.0625)
6	0.350 (.0926)	0.351 (.0740)	0.350 (.0977)	0.280 (.0722)
7	0.427 (.1156)	0.428 (.1026)	0.411 (.1223)	0.358 (.0822)
8	0.448 (.0812)	0.449 (.0595)	0.425 (.0832)	0.378 (.0803)
9	0.502 (.1227)	0.504 (.1086)	0.485 (.1251)	0.432 (.0833)
10	0.291 (.0779)	0.291 (.0934)	0.273 (.0766)	0.216 (.1160)
State-Quarter	Y	Y	Y	N
State-Recession	Y	Y	Y	N
Region-Period	Y	Y	Y	N
Saturated	N	Y	N	N
Exclude Distorted	N	N	Y	N
Num. Obs.	244, 332	244, 332	224, 244	244, 332

Table entries are elasticities of employment with respect to the minimum wage evaluated at each decile of the turnover (worker reallocation rate) distribution. The unit of observation is a state-NAICS3-quarter combination. In this table, each observation is assigned into a decile based only on its 3-digit NAICS industry code. Parenthesized values are robust standard errors clustered at the state level. Column (1) reports a benchmark specification. Column (2) presents the fully saturated specification with state-specific unemployment, state-recession, and state-unemployment-recession effects. Column (3) presents the benchmark, but excludes observations that were substantially distorted as part of QWI confidentiality protection (flag=9). Column (4) presents a standard panel model with state controls, period controls, and state-specific trends.

Table 6: Heterogeneity in Estimated Employment Elasticity by Turnover: National Industry Deciles; with State-Sector Trends

	(1)	(2)	(3)	(4)
Turnover				
Decile				
1	-0.825 (.2373)	-0.822 (.2627)	-0.788 (.2268)	-0.892 (.2907)
2	-0.062 (.0900)	-0.059 (.0598)	-0.088 (.0897)	-0.127 (.0899)
3	-0.733 (.1712)	-0.730 (.1680)	-0.725 (.1671)	-0.799 (.1920)
4	0.100 (.0736)	0.103 (.0539)	0.096 (.0777)	0.035 (.0732)
5	0.113 (.0819)	0.117 (.0728)	0.098 (.0828)	0.048 (.0719)
6	0.090 (.0635)	0.093 (.0616)	0.087 (.0660)	0.024 (.0742)
7	0.767 (.1784)	0.770 (.1688)	0.766 (.1956)	0.702 (.1425)
8	0.426 (.0944)	0.429 (.0755)	0.405 (.1002)	0.359 (.0732)
9	0.257 (.1073)	0.260 (.0922)	0.256 (.1187)	0.190 (.0678)
10	0.063 (.1186)	0.065 (.1289)	0.062 (.1191)	-0.004 (.1658)
State-Quarter	Y	Y	Y	N
State-Recession	Y	Y	Y	N
Region-Period	Y	Y	Y	N
Saturated	N	Y	N	N
Exclude Distorted	N	N	Y	N
Num. Obs.	244, 332	244, 332	224, 244	244, 332

Table entries are elasticities of employment with respect to the minimum wage evaluated at each decile of the turnover (worker reallocation rate) distribution. The unit of observation is a state-NAICS3-quarter combination. In this table, each observation is assigned into a decile based only on its 3-digit NAICS industry code. Parenthesized values are robust standard errors clustered at the state level. All models include state-sector trends. Column (1) reports a benchmark specification. Column (2) presents the fully saturated specification with state-specific unemployment, state-recession, and state-unemployment-recession effects. Column (3) presents the benchmark, but excludes observations that were substantially distorted as part of QWI confidentiality protection (flag=9). Column (4) presents a standard panel model with state controls, period controls, and state-sector trends.

Table 7: Heterogeneity in Estimated Employment Elasticity by Average Duration of Non-employment for Separating Workers: National Industry Deciles

	(1)	(2)	(3)	(4)
Avg. Duration				
Decile				
1	-0.597 (.1199)	-0.593 (.1125)	-0.631 (.1299)	-0.667 (.1512)
2	-1.723 (.4068)	-1.719 (.4211)	-1.688 (.4085)	-1.793 (.4459)
3	0.057 (.0911)	0.061 (.1009)	0.029 (.0979)	-0.016 (.1252)
4	0.270 (.0992)	0.273 (.0863)	0.260 (.1045)	0.198 (.0694)
5	0.350 (.1070)	0.354 (.0931)	0.338 (.1139)	0.279 (.0761)
6	0.214 (.0894)	0.218 (.0708)	0.199 (.0919)	0.144 (.0727)
7	0.367 (.1210)	0.371 (.1099)	0.358 (.1297)	0.298 (.0866)
8	0.437 (.0789)	0.441 (.0584)	0.426 (.0829)	0.365 (.0793)
9	0.584 (.1355)	0.589 (.1231)	0.569 (.1424)	0.513 (.0962)
10	0.564 (.0867)	0.567 (.0826)	0.546 (.0950)	0.488 (.0703)
State-Quarter	Y	Y	Y	N
State-Recession	Y	Y	Y	N
Region-Period	Y	Y	Y	N
Saturated	N	Y	N	N
Exclude Distorted	N	N	Y	N
Num. Obs.	244, 332	244, 332	224, 244	244, 332

Table entries are elasticities of employment with respect to the minimum wage evaluated at each decile of the distribution of average periods of non-employment for separations. The unit of observation is a state-NAICS3-quarter combination. Each observation is assigned into a decile based only on its 3-digit NAICS industry code. Parenthesized values are robust standard errors clustered at the state level. Column (1) reports a benchmark specification. Column (2) presents the fully saturated specification with state-specific unemployment, state-recession, and state-unemployment-recession effects. Column (3) presents the benchmark, but excludes observations that were substantially distorted as part of QWI confidentiality protection (flag=9). Column (4) presents a standard panel model with state controls, period controls, and state-specific trends.



Table 8: Heterogeneity in Estimated Employment Elasticity by Average Duration of Non-employment for Separating Workers: National Industry Deciles; with State-Sector Trends

	(1)	(2)	(3)	(4)
Avg. Duration				
Decile				
1	-0.291 (.1186)	-0.286 (.0875)	-0.338 (.1248)	-0.356 (.1214)
2	-1.357 (.3461)	-1.352 (.3614)	-1.347 (.3483)	-1.423 (.3878)
3	-0.019 (.0990)	-0.014 (.1046)	-0.053 (.1069)	-0.086 (.1390)
4	0.663 (.1217)	0.668 (.1168)	0.650 (.1286)	0.596 (.1033)
5	0.175 (.0741)	0.179 (.0633)	0.169 (.0781)	0.109 (.0711)
6	0.233 (.0776)	0.237 (.0656)	0.218 (.0811)	0.167 (.0650)
7	0.239 (.0767)	0.244 (.0720)	0.232 (.0820)	0.175 (.0688)
8	0.195 (.0786)	0.199 (.0640)	0.191 (.0864)	0.128 (.0691)
9	0.222 (.1229)	0.228 (.1143)	0.220 (.1360)	0.156 (.0813)
10	0.312 (.0747)	0.317 (.0699)	0.314 (.0824)	0.245 (.0710)
State-Quarter	Y	Y	Y	N
State-Recession	Y	Y	Y	N
Region-Period	Y	Y	Y	N
Saturated	N	Y	N	N
Exclude Distorted	N	N	Y	N
Num. Obs.	244, 332	244, 332	224, 244	244, 332

Table entries are elasticities of employment with respect to the minimum wage evaluated at each decile of the distribution of average periods of non-employment for separations. The unit of observation is a state-NAICS3-quarter combination. Each observation is assigned into a decile based only on its 3-digit NAICS industry code. Parenthesized values are robust standard errors clustered at the state level. All models include state-sector trends. Column (1) reports a benchmark specification. Column (2) presents the fully saturated specification with state-specific unemployment, state-recession, and state-unemployment-recession effects. Column (3) presents the benchmark, but excludes observations that were substantially distorted as part of QWI confidentiality protection (flag=9). Column (4) presents a standard panel model with state controls, period controls, and state-specific trends.